## St. Basil's Kymnal

## A REVIEW OF THE NEW EDITION COMPILED BY THE BASILIAN FATHERS

CONSIDERATION of the new edition of known hymnal would well not be complete without reference to the original St. Basil's hymnal, concerning which there has been considerable discussion in Catholic circles for many years. To those who may not be in position to know, it may be well to explain that the original edition (and each successive edition up to the one under consideration at this time) has been condemned by individuals and by organizations like the Society of St. Gregory, for the chief reason that it contained melodies taken from secular and operatic sources, and because from a musical and literary point of view it was probably the poorest and most wretched specimen of the entire collection of miserable hymnals with which the Catholic Church has been afflicted for many generations.

Mr. Joseph Otten writing on this subject in "America" some time ago declared that the publication of St. Basil's Hymnal and Hymnais of like calibre was a misfortune and they should never have been permitted to circulate. He asserted that they were mere "miserable excuses for Catholic hymn books, corrupting children's taste and rendering it almost impossible to initiate them into music and religious poetry worthy of Almighty God and in accord with Catholic intelligence." Other critics in persons of Rev. Fr. Habets, O. M. I. and Dom Lucien David secretary to Dom Pothier (in the Revue du Chant Gregorian, Grenoble), have expressed surprise at the fact that such books were accepted as Catholic hymnals. James P. Dunn another writer in "America" vouchsafed the opinion that St. Basil's was out of date and unmusicianlike in arrangement.

In a comprehensive article on Hymns and Hymn Books, in a recent number of the "Choirmaster" a prominent authority, assuming the pen name of "Hymnologus," after quoting Dr. Terry's famous criticism of the Armagh Hymnal to the effect that this hymnal "was a monument to musical illiteracy" and that it was "difficult to believe that the greater part of the musical setting was intended to be taken seriously, and not as a ghastly joke," stated that "unfortunately also in regard to St. Basil's Hymnal many that stand in high places have allowed themselves to be "Let down' in recommending the book and giving it their approbation." The reviewer, going into detail continued:—

"In fact as regards unchurchliness, musical incompetence and depravity of taste, St. Basil's Hymnal is the saddest

hymnbook we have ever laid eyes on. It offers with few exceptions the most vulgar melodies in nothing but dance and march rhythms, most miserably harmonized and abounding in snatches from the most profane ditties and operettas. Not content with such snatches, it literally takes over entire secular songs, and bungles, curtails or extends them, in order to make them fit its texts. A few examples: No. 41 is nothing but the Russian folk-song circulating in Germany since about 1843 under the name Das Dreigespann: Seht ihr drej Rosse vor dem Wagen und diesen jungen Postillon? No. 16 is the Styrian Yodler: Wenn der Schnee von der Alma weggageth, composed by Hisel in Graz (1820): No. 25 is Proch's well known song Das Alphorn: No. 186 presents the entire melody (with the addition of two flourish: es) of the Thuringian folk-song: Ach, wie ist's moglich dann, das ich dich lassen kann, ascribed to Kucken, but composed by Lux in 1827. No. 22 is, note for note, the American popular song-tune: The Vacant Chair. Nos. 67 and 66 are French secular songs. No. 1 is borrowed from Donizetti's Lucia di Lammermoor. The melody is sung in the opera by Edgardo, as he stabs himself at the grave of his lady love. An edifying association of ideas in church!"

"However much out of place these tunes are in church, they are at least music. But can the honorable designation be given to what is original in St. Basil's Hymnal, so dreadfully barren in ideas and vulgar as it is? The texts from a literary standpoint are worthy of the music: throughout we find sentimental doggerel, poor in ideas and disjointed in thought; at times quite meaningless. In No. 81 a barcarolle, whose harmonies, in all but one and a half bars, oscillate exclusively between the tonic and the dominant, the poet (!) or poetess (!) petitions:

Ora pro nobis, the wave must rock our sleep, Ora, Mater, ora, star of the deep.

This petition is quite superfluous: the melodies and its harmonization do all the rocking to sleep required.

And such a book that stands beneath all criticism pretends to be compiled from approved sources, and dares in its preface to speak of a great end which the aymnal serves. Unfortunately the wretched compilation, that has had a sale of 600.000 copies, can in its preface maintain with but too much truth it is patronized and

encouraged by the devoted educational communities throughout Canada and the United states."

This lengthy quotation is quite in order for it is pertinent to inquire, in view of the statement of the publishers that the new edition has been entirely revised and completely remodelled, how sincere is the conversion, and in what particular manner does this book vary from the criginal edition?

For a reply to this let us examine carefully the new edition and let us begin from the very first page:

Omitting a hymn to St. Basil (witnout number), and proceeding with the first numbered hymn we find our melodic friend (quoted by "Hymnologus") from the opera "Lucia di Lammermoor"! This melody, badly garbled and hiding under a churchly disguise of changed tempo and rhythm is the melody which is used in the opera as a vehicle for these words sung by Edgar before stabbing himself:

"Thou hast spread thy wings to heaven Oh thou spirit pure and tender etc. etc. Bereft of thee I will not live Look and forgive, Tho' by mortals doomed to sever

Love cannot perish; Reft of thee I cannot live etc. etc. etc.

This melody, so widely known serves in this new edition as a melodic support for the text "God of my heart." See example No. 1.

No. 2 in the new edition gives the Protestant Hymn tune "Nearer my God to Thee." (We are considering a Catholic hymnal).
No. 3 "Holy God" contains the same old

errors in the text, found in so many hymnals, viz.: "Everlasting is thy Name" (instead of reign), and "Angel choirs above are singing (instead of raising).

No. 6 is an "Adapted" melody from Haydn.

No. 10 sounds suspiciously like an old south ern negro melody. "Sal' am de pot 'a-boilin!"

No. 11 is undoubtedly derived from our famous "Home Sweet Home." Here is the original tune and the adapted one used for the text "Jesus, Jesus dearest Lord!" (See No. 11 in appendix).

No. 17 is another "adapted" melody from Haydn demonstrating the poverty of our resources.

No. 18 is a splendid example of dance music, being written in mazurka rhythm with a Chorus that (in the first measure) is taken bodily from the Thuringian forlk song "How can I leave thee!"

'No. 21 is seemingly the one time favorite parlor ballad entitled "Too Late!—Too Late!" (referring to the Ten Foolish Virgins). It has in this setting a changed melody in spotsbut the rhythm and outline clearly determine its origin. It here masquerades as a Sacred Heart Song "Pity my God!"

No. 22 is known to every one as the melody of "The Vacant Chair," a famous war song. It will be noted that no acknowledgement is made of the original sources of these melodies and in this manner a species of humbug is practiced for many of our priests and sisters do not know that they are singing melodies originally associated with texts which by no stretch of imagination could be called devotional. (See No. 22 in appendix).



No. 25 is the famous "Alpenhorn" song by Proch, quoted by "Hymnologus." Again no mention is made of the fact that this was one of the popular ballads of the day, and that the original text contains references such as "for the bliss I am in search of, I can find alone with thee!" Why was this considered particularly suitable for a frame upon which to attach the text

"Peace be still! Our God is dwelling Silent on His Altar throne—?

No. 29 "Form your ranks Oh, all we leaguers! is credited to one Zardione. If Mr. Zardione is to be judged as a composer of hymns by this specimen of "hymn tune," the palm for writing the best brass band melody in the entire collection must be awarded to him. It is a pity that the original accompaniment (as given in the earlier editions) was not retained. The attempt to refine the blare and the "um-pah-pah" of the horns as indicated in the original setting is futile, for the melody cries out aloud for its trombone accompaniment and must needs perish at the forced separation. The editor will have something to answer for if he should ever meet Mr. Zardione, for a composer is usually jealous of his artistic children and can not bear to see them truncated or disjointed or even forcibly refined. A vulgar tune is vulgar no matter in what tempo it appears, and this tune savors of the cheap Burlesque notwithstanding its new dress and its Andante tempo indication.

Nos. 37 to 39 (with the exception of Nos. 31 and 38), are all specimens of that type of sentimental melody which is dear to the heart of the Billy Sunday congregations. They are not hymns, but melodies taken from secular sources; they are either piano pieces or mushy melodies found in vocal methods (Concone et al.). These melodies are gushy, oversentimental or inanely cheap in character, and are to be found only in Catholic hymnals of this type and in the Moody and Sankey, and Billy Sunday Revival Hymnals. (Billy Sunday's masterpiece it will be remembered was a hymn concerning "De Brewer's Big Horses—But dem big horses can't run over

me!"). With all our wealth of traditional melodies of unquestioned Catholic origin, we here demonstrate that we are rapidly heading our congregations toward an acceptance of "de Brewery hosses" type of hymn.

No. 40 is a melody clearly taken from German sources. Many will recognize the genuine "Allemand" type and may be able to trace its original title. It is here serving as a melody for the words "In this Sacrament, Sweet Jesus!".

In No. 41 we again meet an old melodic friend "Das Dreigespann" an old Russian Folk Song dressed up in Catholic clothes to fit the text "What light is streaming from the skies." Here is the melody with its adapted text and the German ersion. (See No. 41 in appendix).

No. 50 "Thou for whom I've long been sighing" is set to a melody which sounds very much like the old Civil War songs of the style of "Just before the battle, Mother." It is not a religious melody at any rate.

No. 53 is a typical "Salvation Army" tune and we can readily imagine the street crowd singing it for dear life with the usual accompaniment of tambourine and Cornet.

No. 56 is another tune of this type; it has all the elements of popularity; the conventional swing and the cheap march rhythm, all it needs to place it in its proper category is the accompaniment which exists in the original edition but which was censored in this edition (As if the accompaniment could possibly change a bad tune into good hymn).

In No. 58 we find the compilers have gone to English sources to obtain the melody of a fine old Folk song "Flow gently sweet Afton." Only a little mental effort was required to adjust the words "O purest of creatures" to the music and thus the Catholic imprint was given and the art-product was complete. Here is the original text coupled with the interpolated verses (See No. 58 in appendix).





The fact that a great many persons would know the original melody and would retain their first impression of its connection with "Sweet Afton" despite the effort to connect the melody with "O Purest of Creatures" seems to have been overlooked by the editors. Why should we offer Our Lady second choice or second-hand melodies? Is she not worthy of something better than a musical work cenceived originally as an accompaniment to verses written in honor of a river?

No. 61 is one of the best known of our Catholic hurdy-gurdy tunes. The indication "Andante" (dotted quarter note 50) is caviar to the majority of players. The rhythm of the piece determines its tempo notwithstanding the tempo indications. In this case the composition is of the hurdy-gurdy type and will surely be played in hurdy-gurdy fashion. This and like sickly-sentimental tunes which here follow in steady procession, are to be found enly in Catholic hymnals and in the books put forth by the Moody-Sankey and Billy Sunday type of Evangelists.

No. 70, "Raise your voices vales and mountains" is another melody borrowed from our ever popular "Home Sweet Home." The Chorus, as will be seen from the appended example is a direct reproduction of the famous home seng with but a changed accent: (See example 70).

No. 72 is a weak imitation of one of Wallace's melodies (from Maritana if memory does not play false), set to the text "How pure, how frail."

No. 78—Unfold ye Golden Gates of Heaven is set to a melody by one of the editors. The Chorus of this march (for it is certainly not a hymn or devotional tune), sets the feet a-going and one can readily picture the boys following the brass band, keeping time and imitating the sound of the trumpets.

The familiar barcarolle-like "Ave Sanctissima" No. 80 has been retained even to the line "The wave must rock our sleep Ora Mater," etc.

Fr. Lambilotte is responsible for No. 83 and

has much to answer for. Many of our wishy-washy and mucilaginous hymn tunes are from the pen of this worthy priest who utilized the musical idiom of the Offenbachian period and as a result, we have a decadent type of church music which has been handed down to us as a relic of the golden era of French Opera Bouffe.

No. 85 is here given as a hymn to Our Lady with the title of "The star of the ocean is risen." In its original form the melody is recognized as the "Lorei" a familiar folk song of Germany. (See example 85).

No. 92 gives us the famous "Help! Help! Help!" song quoted by Hymnologus. No charge of involved or modern harmonic treatment in the accompaniment to this melody can be brought with any degree of justice against the composer, for we have just three chords in the entire piece: tonic, subdominant and dominant. In fact tais element of simplicity was one of the chief attractions of the original "St. Basil's" and we are glad to note that not too great a strain has been placed on the mental equipment of cur organists in this new edition. Some of the piano accompaniments and cadenzas and barber-shop-chords have been changed it is true but admiters of the St. Basil type of hymns need have no fear that all the attractive features of the original have been supercensored or eliminated.

Musicians, looking at these melodies taken from such well known secular sources would likely gather that the music for our non-liturgical functions must indeed have fallen to a low estate if such abominations in the form of hymns were accepted as a typical Catholic art product.

However, let us examine a few more hymns in the English and then turn our attention to the Latin section: Here is a model dance tune with variations posing as a hymn to the Blessed Virgin (No. 115).

The chorus of this ribald tune (in mazurka rhythm "gain), is probably the best illustration of the type of hymn which may please



certain elements among our Catholic people; let us hope that a newer generation will have been trained to detect the difference between a dance tune and a genuinely devotional melody. Lambilotte's famous "Notre Dame" hymn is found with all its frills and rococo twists at No. 118, while next door to it we see Gottschalk's favorite piano piece "The Last Hope," serving as a basis for the hymn "Mary unto thee I call."

No. 122 given as a hymn to the Blessed Virgin is a typical hunting song to the "The Sun is shining brightly." words: At 124 we find the same incorrect version of the traditional "Stabat Mater" melody which disfigures so many hymnals. 123 is a hymn to St. Joseph, an old familiar tune newly accoutred by J. Brazil. Italian opera choruses all end in one manner, at least in the old Italian operas we could always anticipate the ending of the piece because of the recurrent tonic and dominant phrases. The ending to this operatic St. Joseph hymn is worthy of its Italian progenitors but it is really amazing to think that in the year of our Lord 1919 musicians and publishers would dare to issue such a cenventional hack horse in the form of music of this type, and have the courage to label it church music. No. 147 is an old French "Bergerette" originally a song by Pergolese allied to a love text. In this book we find it masquerading under the title of a hymn to Our Lady. "Like the dawning of the morning." It would be instructive to say the least, to put the original text and Father Faber's in parallel columns, No. 153 has for a refrain, an exact reproduction of the school game melody "London bridge is falling down!"

No. 165 gives us another text to the Pergolese melody originally conceived as a love song (Bergerette). No. 173 Alleluia! Alleluia! is nothing more than the celebrated "When the swallows homeward fly" by Franz Abt. Here we can see both the original and the interpolated text. (See No. 173 in the appendix).

No. 177—"Haec Dies"—a discarded setting by Bordese. Since the Motu Proprio was issued, this type of composition has been almost eliminated. Was the insertion of this number intended as an appeal to those who may not have read the dictum of Pope Pius X on the subject of modern church nusic?

No. 178 appears with the incorrect raised leading tone, which destroys the modal character of the composition entirely. In the

remaining English Hymns there are many equally bad examples as those quoted. We shall have to devote a little space to the Latin Section however and will proceed to an examination of the Chant. The use of quarter notes may be permissible, but the adoption of such a notation in the opinion of the reviewer, destroys the value of a certain contrast which is achieved by the use of eighth and quarter notes. The mora vocis, for instance, can best be illustrated in modern notation by the use of quarter note ending in accordance with the system advocated by the Solesmes monks themselves.

Apart from this consideration however we find on examining No. 254 closely that the text has been incorrectly apportioned to the notes (Pange Lingua) at the words mysterium—ventris and effudit while the "Amen" melody does not accord with the Vatican edition. Does not Rome require that any reproduction of the chant should comform to the typical Vatican edition?

No. 256 is a Gregorian Chant (Parce Domine), in measured rhythm and in modern form—, another distortion—and such a useless procedure.

No. 257 gives a new syllabization for the word Sa-cra-tis-si-mum; on one note at the end of first line the two syllables si-mum are run together in quite a comical fashion.

Hybrid Psalm Tones are utilized at Nos. 259 and 260 for the Miserere and Benedictus respectively. Why not give the correct psalm tones according to the Antiphonale Romanum?

At No. 262 we note a garbled version of the great "Veni Creator" melody. What justification can there be at this time, so many years after the advent of a typical Vatican edition of Chant, to use such mutilated versions of the Chants? Probably the most ludicrous example of a distorted musical setting is the amalgamation of text and music at No. 265. In Chant the principles advocated by the Solesmes Monks with regard to the ictus and its relation to the tonic accent work out beautifully. In modern music, the attempt to put the same principles into operation results disastrously as can be noted by this particular "Ave Maria Stella." Imagine children yelling out on the unaccented syllabes in this fashion, according to the rhythm of the melody, in 6-8 time a-VE, ma-RIS stel-LA-de-I ma-TER al-MA at-QUF sem-PER vir-GO fe-LIX coe-LI por-TA.



Every stanza sung according to the music here given will give the above one-legged effect.

At No. 267 appears a mutilated Gregorian melody (Iste Confessor,—also at 258.

In the Litany of the Blessed Virgin (No. 270) we note the omission of the REGINA PACIS, ORA PRO NOBIS, ordered to be inserted by His Holiness some years ago. The Psalm "Deus in Adjutorium" has an incorrect Psalm tone assigned to it. (P. 275).

Pursuing our examination further we note on page 278 a setting of an O Salutaris to the melody sung generally in non Catholic churches to the words of "Old Hundred" but the climax of the entire work is reached at No. 274 (Tantum Ergo).

We are nere asked to subscribe through the singing of the German song (notwithstanding its Austrian origin), to the sentiments "Germany! Germany! above all!!" in the tune allocted to the "Tantum Ergo" on page 280. Here is the original setting by Haydn and the distorted version adopted for the Latin text. (See Appendix No. 274).

If we object very seriously to confusing our religious feelings with the national aspirations of one of our recent enemies, we have the option of rendering homage to another departed ruler, the Czar of a Russia that is no more. The melody allotted to the text of the second Tantum Ergo brings vividly to mind the era of anarchy and terror in the country whose National song we here adopt as a vehicle of praise to Our Lord in the Most Holy Sacrament of the Altar? What an association!! (See Appendix No. 274b).

Verily, anything will do for use in the Catholic Church according to the evidence here brought to view. Publishers are proceeding on the theory that no one knows the difference and no one cares. And they may be justified in this assumption judging from the support they have received at the hands of those in authority.

Hybrid Psalm Tones fill the remainder of the book and in the Requiem Mass (Gregorian) there occur any number of errors in the co-ordination of text to music. A Dumont Mass is included while Mr. Brazil contributes a Mass in four parts written in the old time conventional form. "Et unam Sanctum" is



given instead of "Sanctam" in the "Credo" while in the Agnus Dei (the very last page of the book) there are two glaring errors in the text. This is the text according to the Brazii version:

Agnus Dei, qui tollis peccata mundi. (Miserere nobis omitted).

Agnus Dei, qui tollis peccata mundi, miserere nobis.

Agnus Dei, qui tollis peccata mundi, miserere!! miserere nobis.

Dona nobis pacem, dona nobis pacem, dona nobis pacem, pacem.

The Missal and the Graduale Romanum give this authentic reading:

Agnus Dei qui tollis peccata mundi; miserere nobis.

Agnus Dei, qui tollis peccata mundi; miserere nobis.

Agnus Dei, qui tollis peccata mundi; cona nobis pacem.

Rome announced some years ago, that all publications giving versions of Gregorian Chant should agree strictly with the Vatican Edition. We original this book nothing but a mass of distortions and perversions of the Chant. The impression has been created by the publishers that the new edition was strictly in accordance with the wishes of the Holy See (although no specific mention is made of the fact in the preface). The distortions of both text and music occur in the Pange Lingua (254), the Veni Creator (262), the Litany of the Saints (272) (with its incorrect "Agnus Dei") and the Psalm tone, Deus in adjutorium. The Vespers of the Sunday are given and a subtitle informs us that the setting is taken from the "Antiphonarium Romanum." The setting is not in accordance with the Antiphonarium issued by the Vatican press which we are supposed to follow. The Chant "Ave Regina" (299) is also badly garbled. The setting of the Regina Coeli, by Labet (No. 300), is the best example of Sacred dance music that could possibly be imagined. This composition (if we can so dignify it), reflects the true character of the hymnal as a whole, and we can base our impression of the musical value of the entire work upon this typical piece de resistance with its tripping measures and musical comedy atmosphere.

The publishers have emphasized the fact that certain objectionable features found in the earlier editions have been omitted in this new edition. Does the elimination of the pianistic accompaniments, the omission of the cadenzas and the florid roulades warrant the retention of the prime offenders — the melodies? These melodies exhale the breath of a former period—the decadent period of church music. It was exactly this type of music that the late Pope Pius of happy memory, referred to, when he asked, or rather commanded that the music of the

church conform to the laws of true art. It is this kind of music that offends against our sense of the fitness of things. "Sacred music"—quotes a well-known authority,—"should conform to the law of prayer."

"The law of prayer must be the law of song, both that our prayer may be good art and our art good prayer."

To return to our first question "In what manner does this book differ from the original edition? The answer can only be that the voice is the voice of Jacob but the nand is that of Esau! St. Basil's Hymnal is St. Basil's notwithstanding the new investiture and excellent printing, and the strictures pronounced upon it by "Hymnologus"—apply just as well to the new edition as they did to the original work.

M. Colas.

## THE TRAINING OF BOYS' VOICES

## by E. C. Sherwood

Those interested in the matter of vocal training who have had occasion to examine the numerous text books devoted to the cultivation of the boy voice. may have observed that the methods advocated therein are quite at variance with the methods of voice training generally adopted for the adult voice.

We must confess to some perplexity as to the reason for this—and have not yet been able to obtain a 37tis!actory reply to the question "Why should a certain method be used for the deelopment of the boy voice which would not serve as well for the guidance of the adult singer"?

For the benefit of those who may not have delved deeply in the subject I would explain briefly that the main object undertaken by the sponsors of the method of boy voice training generally known as the English Choir School Method is the elimination of the so-called chest voice (lower register of the voice).

All the exercises given are solely for the development of the head register. The reason given for this procedure is that if a boy is allowed to use his lower voice in a natural manner he will sing in the same harsh, disagreeable style of a boy selling newspapers, in the streets.

The so-called English Choir School method of training boys is now in general use throughout England and has been adopted by many choirmasters in this country. There is no question but that it makes the work of the choirmaster easier, for since the lower register, is through this method totally